

HISTORIC BUILDINGS COUNCIL

391st Meeting

The Conference Room, Lesley Exchange 1, East Bridge St, Belfast
on

Friday, 18 June 2010 at 10.15am

Present:

Mr F Robinson – Chairman
Ms I Andrews
Mr K Boston
Mr J Diamond
Mr B Green
Mr P Harron (*Items 1-8*)
Ms N Houston
Mr M Martin
Mr R Miles (*Items 1-8*)
Mrs U O'Hare (*Items 1-8*)
Dr P Warke

In Attendance:

Mr M Deery, NIEA
Ms J Lunn, NIEA
Ms C Maguire, NIEA (*Items 1-6*)
Mr D MacRandal, NIEA (*Items 1-8*)
Mr D Boyle, NIEA (*Items 9-13*)

Ms E Hanratty, PS

Ms B McAlister, Secretariat
Ms K Robin, Secretariat

1. POTENTIAL OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST ISSUES

The Chairman began by asking members to declare any conflict of interest on agenda items - none received from members.

2. APOLOGIES AND WELCOME

Apologies received from Mr Brian Banks, Professor Joe FitzGerald, Mrs Agnes Peacocke, Mr Patrick McGuigan, Mr Cathal Crimmins, Mr Alistair Lindsay and Ms Hannah Kenny. The Chairman welcomed Ms Hanratty from Planning Service to the meeting.

3. MINUTES OF THE 390th MEETING

The minutes of the 390th Meeting of the 14 May 2010 were agreed.

4. CHAIRMAN'S BUSINESS

4.1 The Chairman reported that he attended the RICS Awards where an award was presented to St Malachy's Church in Belfast for conservation, the only award for conservation. Two Mausoleums received conservation commendations.

4.2 The Chairman reported on the HBC sub-group which met 20 May to discuss the proposed revisions on the Criteria for Listing consultation. A draft response to the consultation has been prepared and there is still time for members to add their comments prior to the deadline for submission 6 July 2010.

Action	Final comments and submission	Members/Secretariat
--------	-------------------------------	---------------------

4.3 The Chairman reported that he had attended a SACs meeting with Matrix Planning Consultancy to discuss the next proposed phase submitted by OMYA UK for their mining operations at Glenarm Quarry.

4.4 The Chairman reported that he attended the Quarterly SACs meeting with the DOE sponsor branch hosted by Mr Peter Aiken, Acting Director of Corporate Services. Following the meeting the SACs will be requesting meetings with the Permanent Secretary and the Public Commissioners office. The Chairman will report back to Council with details of the meetings.

4.5 The Chairman reported that he attended a farewell lunch on 7 June for Mr Cyril Francey, former SAC's Secretariat who retired in May 2009. At Mr Francey's request this was a small informal send-off and Council's were represented by the current SACs Chairs and three past Chairmen. Mr Francey was presented with a painting in recognition for his years of dedicated service to the Councils.

- 4.6 The Chairman reported that he attended the annual Heritage Council dinner at the new Tollymore National Outdoor Centre on 10 June. The Heritage Council is the SACs equivalent in the Republic of Ireland and includes Government departments.
- 4.7 The Chairman reported that he attended the Chair's Forum Event on the 16 June. The lunchtime briefing was chaired by Ms Felicity Huston, Public Appointments Commissioner and proved to be an insightful and useful event.
- 4.8 The Chairman reported that he had recently spoken to the Dean of Down Cathedral, Dean T Henry Hull. This was a follow up to Council's request for details of proposed alterations to the interior of Down Cathedral, a Grade A listed building. HBC have not received any written details of alterations but Council were told verbally that planning was at a very early stage. The Chairman reported that the proposed changes included installing additional lighting in the entrance way, adding signage, removal of timber below the window behind the alter, moving alter, rails and its raised floor forward to improve sightlines and extending the seat portion inside the box pews for comfort and possibly removing the box pews. The central box pews have already been removed. NIEA confirmed that no consent is required for this work under ecclesiastical exemption. The Chairman reported that the NI Tourist Board is providing funding for the cost of the installation of the lighting element at the front door. This will allow clearer notice of historic and tourist information highlighting the historic elements associated with the Cathedral and to help maximise the Cathedral's attraction for tourists. Council agreed that to reduce/remove/destroy the cathedral's present interior may remove some of its attraction and it was suggested that the Council write to NITB and ask if these alterations and their ramifications had been considered in their business plan for the proposed changes.

Action

Prepare letter to NITB

Chairman

5. **PLANNING CONSULTATION PROTOCOL**

Mr. Deery reviewed with Council the HBC/NIEA Protocol paper. This paper was agreed with HBC in September 2008 but following concerns raised after the Riddle Hall planning case last year the Agency had agreed to revisit it. New members had received a copy at their induction meeting in March 2010. The purpose of the protocol is to outline when NIEA will consult with the Historic Buildings Council. NIEA are proposing to amend the current paper to include a specific section on Pre Application Discussions (PAD). Mr Deery encouraged members to review the proposed revisions and submit any comments Council may have to the proposed changes. The proposed revisions aim to improve clarity for HBC and NIEA on when Council should be consulted. If members have any comments they should be submitted.

The Chairman thanked Mr Deery for his presentation.

6. **PLANNING**

6.1 **Holy Trinity Church, Ballycastle**

Mr MacRandal of NIEA presented an overview of the earlier proposed schemes and the current revised scheme for the Holy Trinity Church, the Diamond, Ballycastle noting that the Church is a Grade A Listed Building.

Scheme 1 proposed the building of a new vestry and crèche cum social area within the Church boundary wall. This application was rejected on the grounds of scale, massing and the opinion that overall the proposal scheme would distract from the Church setting. This had been the subject of a previous consultation with HBC.

Scheme 2 - Although amendments had been made to the original scheme issues still existed including massing along the gable end and the scheme still compromised the appearance and setting of the Church.

Scheme 3 proposed the location of the new vestry and crèche outside the church's boundary wall and a glazed link offering a connection between the church and the crèche area which would provide shelter between the two buildings. NIEA requested feedback from Council on the proposed glazed link asking if it impinges on the setting of the church.

In the discussion following the presentation Council agreed that the need for the linked corridor did not appear to be justified but recommended that if essential to the Church it could be more sympathetic in design and materials. Some members suggested the possibility of a solid wall structure to complement the exterior stone wall and provide a screen.

In conclusion Council feels the current scheme has made good progress and improved. However, the Church is an important Grade A building and the proposals need to retain the historical integrity of the property and the setting. NIEA will keep HBC informed on the development of proposals.

The Chairman thanked Mr MacRandal for his presentation

6.2 Mew Island Lighthouse, Donaghadee – HB 24/06/034

Ms Maguire, NIEA provided a progress report to Council on the long running issue of the Mew Island Lighthouse compressor engines and fog signal. Ms Maguire has liaised with the Commissioners of Irish Lights (COIL), owners of the lighthouse and equipment. The lighthouse is currently listed as a Grade B listed building. At one time the lighthouse had a pneumatic fog signal powered by air compressors. The system was discontinued in 1991 and since then although the equipment was retained, limited maintenance was carried out to prevent deterioration of the equipment. The equipment no longer supports the aids to navigation at Mew Island Lighthouse and continued expenditure in maintaining redundant equipment cannot be justified.

Opportunities for partnership arrangements were sought so the equipment could be retained for future generations. Ideally it was hoped that the compressors, engines and fog signal equipment be installed in a local working museum or base, where they would be looked after and be on view to the public for the future. Expressions of interest came from several NI bodies but the high costs of moving, maintaining and housing this equipment resulted in no local home being found. Fortunately there were many expressions of interest in from the UK mainland for the equipment.

With no local home available, NIEA and COIL had to consider the best long term plans for the equipment and welcomed the interest of the Museum in Fishguard in Wales. Council recognized the large cost to maintain this equipment and welcomed the fact that the equipment will be retained and recorded.

The Chairman thanked Ms Maguire for her presentation.

7. SECOND SURVEY

Mr Lunn presented to Council a delisting in Drumquin, Co Tyrone

Council considered 1 proposal for delisting.

The Chairman thanked Ms Lunn for her presentation

Council suggested that NIEA categorise this type of delisting and include reason for delisting in the statistical information to assist NIEA in the management of material.

8. HERITAGE LED REGENERATION DERRY CITY COUNCIL AREA BOOKLET

Mr Deery presented to Council an overview of the Heritage Led Regeneration Derry City Council Area Booklet. A copy of the booklet was circulated to members along with an opinion piece for the Belfast Telegraph referring to the publication by the Minister of the Environment. Mr Deery explained the booklet was originally produced to highlight England,

Article 31 outline application including an enabling report which is with NIEA for consideration. There are roads and contamination issues on the full and outline applications which need to be addressed by the agent. The Department will make a recommendation to the Minister on the Article 31 outline application when all issues are resolved. The full and listed building consent applications will be presented to Council when outstanding matters have been resolved.

Action Update Council PS

10.9 Myrtle Lodge, Newcastle, TPO

PS reported that the Departmental Solicitors Office has provided advice which has to be discussed internally before a view is taken on how to proceed.

Action Update Council PS

10.10 Glenarm, Former Fish Factory

PS reported that they held a meeting with the architects and requested further amendments be submitted for consideration.

Action Update Council on progress PS

10.11 Planning General Development (GDO)

No further update at this time, consultation responses still being reviewed.

Action Update Council on progress PS

10.12 Article 4 Directives, Pilot Projects

PS reported that a paper has been discussed by the PS Management Board and that Mr Peter Mulaney is currently preparing a submission for the Department Board and the Minister.

Action Update Council on progress PS

11. MEMBERS REPORTS

None

12. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

12.1 First Ballymacarrett Church

Please note this item was tabled immediately following Item 8 on the agenda.

Mr Paul Harron reported that during the course of his research into Young & Mackenzie he had reviewed the First Ballymacarrett Presbyterian Church, Belfast, Paulett Street, Belfast and reported that the church is to close at the end of September this year. Mr Harron provided an overview of the Church's feature, noting that the façade (Scrabo sandstone) has, predictably, weathered badly and there is evidence of water penetration from the roof and some of the windows on the side elevations, but noted that the interior is very good, totally intact with great turn-of-the-century fixtures and fittings and some Art Nouveau painted glass as well as four excellent stained glass windows in one of the galleries. There is also an old 2-storey Victorian school behind the church and a hall from 1920s beside it. Mr Harron requested that NIEA review as a listing query.

Mr Deery reported that the procedure for handling listing queries involve sending an architect out to conduct an initial report which includes a risk assessment and after consideration of the initial report NIEA will decide whether or not to include in the second survey or to conduct an ad hoc survey. Decisions take into consideration available resources and funding. Ms Lunn reported that she had conducted an initial inspection of the site and an initial report will be drawn up for consideration.

Action Update Council on decision of initial report NIEA

12.2 Grant Scheme for Listed Buildings

Council requested information on the NIEA grant scheme for built heritage. Mr Deery agreed to present information prepared from the 1st quarter to Council and will update Council on this information on a regular basis.

Action Circulate 1st quarter information with meeting papers Secretariat

12.3 No. 3 Maxwell Drive, Bangor

The Chairman reported that a response from Council had been prepared and submitted to residents of Maxwell Drive, Bangor regarding the planning consent for work carried out at No.3 Maxwell Drive and a copy circulated to members.

12.4 Titanic Museum

The Chairman reported that Victoria Kingston, Museum Planner for Titanic Quarter has requested a meeting with HBC members. A meeting date will be arranged. Mr Martin expressed an interest in attending this meeting with the Chairman.

Action Meeting date to be arranged Secretariat

12.5 NIEA Enforcement Policy Consultation

The Chairman requested comments from members on Phase 2 of the NIEA Enforcement Policy consultation.

Action Consultation response to be submitted Chairman

12.6 Piney Ridge, Belfast

NIEA presented an updated on the outcome of the recent court case relating to the Piney Ridge property, Malone Road, Belfast, an important early Twentieth Century House in an Arts and Crafts style. Following a fire on the Easter weekend of 2008 which gutted the vacant and landlocked building the owner and contractor had been concerned that the remaining walls were dangerous and constituted a risk to the local population. They had demolished the property and informed the Department as required by Article 44(7) of the Planning Order. The owner and contractor were found guilty to unlawful demolition and fined £150 and £200 respectively.

13. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

NIEA noted the possibility of a special meeting of Council to receive a presentation of the 2nd Survey listings. Members are asked to tentatively hold Friday 20 August for this meeting. Date will be confirmed as soon as possible.

The date of the next confirmed meeting is Friday, 17 September.